



A REVIEW OF THE DEBATE
BETWEEN
BATĀLAVĪ AND CHAKRHĀLAVĪ



A Review of the Debate
between
Batālavī and Chakrhālavī

*What is the True Status of
the Holy Quran and the Hadith*

by

Ḥaḍrat Mirza Ghulam Ahmad

*The Promised Messiah and Mahdi^{as},
Founder of the Ahmadiyya Muslim Community*

*Published under the auspices of Ḥaḍrat Mirza Masroor Ahmad,
Imam and Head of the Worldwide Ahmadiyya Muslim Community,
Fifth Successor to the Promised Messiah^{as},
may Allah the Almighty help him with His powerful support*

ISLAM INTERNATIONAL PUBLICATIONS LTD.

A Review of the Debate between
Batālāvī and Chakrhālāvī

English translation of:
Review Bar Mubāhathah Batālāvī Wa Chakrhālāvī (Urdu)

Written by Ḥaḍrat Mirza Ghulam Ahmad
The Promised Messiah and Mahdi, peace be on him,
Founder of the Ahmadiyya Muslim Community

First published in Urdu in Qadian, India, 1902
First English translation published in the UK, 2014

© Islam International Publications Ltd.

Published by
Islam International Publications Ltd.
(Additional Wakālat-e-Taṣnīf)
Islamabad, Sheephatch Lane
Tilford, Surrey GU10 2AQ, UK

For further information please visit www.alislam.org.

ISBN 978-1-84880-065-6

CONTENTS

| | |
|-------------------------------|-------------|
| <i>About the Author</i> | <i>vii</i> |
| <i>Publisher's Note</i> | <i>ix</i> |
| <i>Foreword</i> | <i>xiii</i> |

| | |
|--|----------|
| A Review of the Debate between Batālavi and Chakrhālavi | 1 |
|--|----------|

| | |
|-----------------------|-----------|
| <i>Glossary</i> | <i>19</i> |
| <i>Index</i> | <i>21</i> |

ABOUT THE AUTHOR

Ḥaḍrat Mirza Ghulam Ahmad^{as} was born in 1835 in Qadian, India. From his early life, he dedicated himself to prayer, and the study of the Holy Quran and other scriptures. He was deeply pained to observe the plight of Islam, which was being attacked from all directions. In order to defend Islam and present its teachings in their pristine purity, he wrote more than ninety books, thousands of letters, and participated in many religious debates. He argued that Islam is a living faith, which can lead man to establish communion with God to achieve moral and spiritual perfection.

Ḥaḍrat Mirza Ghulam Ahmad^{as} started experiencing divine dreams, visions, and revelations at a young age. In 1889, under divine command, he started accepting initiation into the Ahmadiyya Muslim Community. The divine revelations continued to increase and he was commanded by God to announce that God had appointed him to be the same Reformer of the latter days as prophesied by various religions under different titles. He claimed to be the same Promised Messiah and Mahdi whose advent had been prophesied by the Holy Prophet Muhammad^{saw}.

The Ahmadiyya Muslim Community is now established in more than two hundred countries.

After his demise in 1908, the institution of *Khilāfat* (successorship) was established to succeed him, in fulfilment of the prophecies made in the Holy Quran and by the Holy Prophet Muhammad^{saw}. Ḥaḍrat Mirza Masroor Ahmad^{aba} is the Fifth Successor to the Promised Messiah^{as} and the present head of the Ahmadiyya Muslim Community.

PUBLISHER'S NOTE

Please note that, in the translation that follows, words given in parentheses () are the words of the Promised Messiah^{as}. If any explanatory words or phrases are added by the translators for the purpose of clarification, they are put in square brackets []. Footnotes given by the publisher are marked '[Publisher]'.

References to the Holy Quran contain the name of the *sūrah* [chapter] followed by a chapter:verse citation, e.g., *Sūrah al-Jumu'ah*, 62:4, and counts *Bismillāhir-Raḥmānir-Raḥim* ['In the name of Allah, the Gracious, the Merciful'] as the first verse in every chapter it appears.

The following abbreviations have been used:

saw *ṣallallāhu 'alaihi wa sallam*, meaning 'peace and blessings of Allah be upon him', is written after the name of the Holy Prophet Muhammad^{saw}.

as *'alaihis-salām*, meaning 'peace be on him', is written after the name of Prophets other than the Holy Prophet Muhammad^{saw}.

ra *raḍiyallāhu ‘anhu/‘anhā/‘anhum*, meaning ‘Allah be pleased with him/her/them’, is written after the names of the Companions of the Holy Prophet Muhammad^{saw} or of the Promised Messiah^{as}.

rta *raḥmatullāh ‘alaihi/‘alaibā/‘alaihim*, meaning ‘Allah shower His mercy upon him/her/them’, is written after the names of the deceased pious Muslims who are not Companions of the Holy Prophet Muhammad^{saw} or of the Promised Messiah^{as}.

aba *ayyadahullāhu Tā‘ālā binaṣrihil-‘Azīz*, meaning ‘may Allah the Almighty help him with His powerful support’, is written after the name of the present head of the Aḥmadiyya Muslim Community, Ḥaḍrat Mirza Masroor Ahmad, Khalīfatul-Masīḥ V^{aba}.

Readers are urged to recite the full salutations when reading the book.

In general, we have adopted the following system established by the Royal Asiatic Society for our transliteration.

ا at the beginning of a word, pronounced as *a*, *i*, *u* preceded by a very slight aspiration, like *h* in the English word *honour*.

ث *th* – pronounced like *th* in the English word *thing*.

ح *h* – a guttural aspirate, stronger than *h*.

- خ *kh* – pronounced like the Scottish *ch* in *loch*.
 ذ *dh* – pronounced like the English *th* in *that*.
 ص *ṣ* – strongly articulated *s*.
 ض *ḍ* – similar to the English *th* in *this*.
 ط *ṭ* – strongly articulated palatal *t*.
 ظ *ẓ* – strongly articulated *z*.
 ع ‘ – a strong guttural, the pronunciation of which must be learnt by the ear.
 غ *gh* – a sound similar to the French *r* in *grasseye*, and to the German *r*. It requires the muscles of the throat to be in the ‘gargling’ position to pronounce it.
 ق *q* – a deep guttural *k* sound.
 ء ’ – a sort of catch in the voice.

Short vowels are represented by:

- a* for $\text{—}^{\text{—}}$ (like *u* in *bud*).
i for $\text{—}^{\text{—}}$ (like *i* in *bid*).
u for $\text{—}^{\text{و}}$ (like *oo* in *wood*).

Long vowels by:

- \bar{a} for $\text{—}^{\text{ا}}$ or \bar{a} (like *a* in *father*).
 \bar{i} for $\text{—}^{\text{ى}}$ or $\text{—}^{\text{ا}}$ (like *ee* in *deep*).
 \bar{u} for $\text{—}^{\text{و}}$ (like *oo* in *root*).

Other vowels by:

- ai* for $\text{—}^{\text{ى}}$ (like *i* in *site*).

au for ۱۰ — (resembling *ou* in *sound*).

The consonants not included in the above list have the same phonetic value as in the principal languages of Europe. While the Arabic ۛ is represented by *n*, we have indicated the Urdu ۛ as *ṅ*. As noted above, the single quotation mark ‘ is used for transliterating ۛ which is distinct from the apostrophe ’ used for ۛ.

We have not transliterated some Arabic words which have become part of English language, e.g., Islam, Quran, hadith, Mahdi, jihad, Ramadan and ummah. The Royal Asiatic Society’s rules of transliteration for names of persons, places, and other terms, are not followed throughout the book as many of the names contain non-Arabic characters and carry a local transliteration and pronunciation style.

FOREWORD

In November of 1902 a debate took place between Muḥammad Ḥussain Batālavī and ‘Abdullāh Chakrhālavī on the importance and position of the Holy Quran and the hadith. Maulavī Muḥammad Ḥussain who belonged to the *Ahl-e-Hadith* sect of Islam argued that the hadith of the Holy Prophet Muhammad^{saw} were an absolute and final authority in Islamic jurisprudence and that even the Holy Quran was to be judged and studied in light of these narrations. On the other hand, Maulavī ‘Abdullāh, a proponent of the *Ahl-e-Quran* sect of Islam suggested that the hadith were nothing more than a heap of unreliable, inauthentic and dubious narrations of no consequence. Furthermore, Maulavī ‘Abdullāh propounded that the only true source of guidance in Islam was the Holy Quran, which was the unaltered word of God and that all the hadith were worthy of being discarded. Both clerics argued vehemently in support of their starkly differing and extreme views.

Ḥaḍrat Mirza Ghulam Ahmad of Qadian, the Promised Messiah and Mahdi and founder of the Ahmadiyya Muslim

Community wrote a succinct yet comprehensive analysis and review on these two extreme and flawed views. He eloquently presented a well-reasoned and rational perspective on the issue at hand in his capacity as a divinely appointed Prophet of God. In this comparative analysis the Promised Messiah^{as} elaborates that the Holy Quran and sunnah ought to be placed above the hadith. A verbal narration attributed to the Holy Prophet^{saw} which contradicts these two sources of guidance cannot possibly be his words. A narration, however, which does not contradict the two aforementioned sources, ought to be readily accepted.

This book was first rendered from Urdu into English by Mirza Usman Ahmad. It was then revised by Ayyaz Mahmood Khan and proofread by Abdul Quddus Arif. Additionally, Tahir Mahmood Mubashir, Syed Tanwir Mujtaba, Abdul-Wahab Mirza, and Fouzan Pal also assisted in various capacities to prepare the final layout of the book. The cover was designed by Shahrukh Omar. May Allah abundantly reward them all for their efforts. *Āmīn.*

Munir-ud-Din Shams
Additional Wakīl-ut-Taṣnīf
London
16 June 2014

بِسْمِ اللّٰهِ الرَّحْمٰنِ الرَّحِیْمِ
نَحْمَدُهٗ وَنُصَلِّیْ عَلٰی رَسُوْلِهِ الْكَرِیْمِ ۱

A Review of the Debate between
Maulavī Abū Sa‘īd Muḥammad Ḥussain Batālavī
and Maulavī ‘Abdullāh Chakrhālavī
by the Promised Messiah, the Divine Arbitrator,
and a Word of Advice for his Community

Judging from the writings of the two parties involved, it appears that the basis for the aforementioned debate was Maulavī ‘Abdullāh’s contention that the hadith of the Holy Prophet^{saw} ought to be discarded entirely. Similarly, he was guilty of such foul utterances that even to mention them is disrespectful. Conversely, Maulavī Muḥammad Ḥussain articulated the proposition that if the hadith were considered to be so worthless, inauthentic and unreliable, then the vast majority of [Islamic modes of] worship and *fiqhah* [Islamic Jurisprudence] would be rendered invalid, for it is the hadith alone that shed light on the precise details of the commandments of the Holy Quran. If the Quran is

1. In the name of Allah, the Ever Gracious, the Ever Merciful. We praise Him and invoke His blessings upon His noble Messenger^{saw}. [Publisher]

considered sufficient what evidence from the Quran alone can be furnished to support that the obligatory morning prayer consists of two *rak'āt*,¹ *maghrib* [prayer] comprises three and the remaining three [prayers] compose of four *rak'āt* each.

Although inherently flawed, this rebuttal was still overpowering and this is why 'Abdullāh Ṣāhib was unable to provide any satisfying reply and only responded with absurdities which are not even worth mentioning. However, the objection raised by Maulavī Muḥammad Ḥussain Batālvī consequently forced 'Abdullāh Ṣāhib to invent a new form of *ṣalāt*² which was completely incongruous with anything practiced by all the sects of Islam. He removed the *attahīyyāt*,³ *durūd*⁴ and other customary prayers of the Holy Prophet^{saw} from the *ṣalāt* and only Quranic verses were incorporated in their stead. He further proposed numerous other innovations in the *ṣalāt* which need not be mentioned here, and perhaps he even sought to ordain changes in the practices of the hajj and zakat. Is it true that the hadith are really as worthless and futile as Maulavī 'Abdullāh Ṣāhib suggests. God forbid, not at all.

The fact of the matter is that of the two parties, both have verged on opposite extremes. Firstly, Maulavī Muḥammad Ḥussain is correct in enunciating the argument that authentic hadith which can be traced back to the Holy Prophet^{saw} cannot

-
1. A single complete cycle of a prayer. [Publisher]
 2. The second pillar of Islam, *ṣalāt* refers to the obligatory Prayers required of Muslims five times a day. [Publisher]
 3. A prayer recited in the sitting position of the *ṣalāt*. [Publisher]
 4. To invoke blessings upon the Holy Prophet^{saw}. [Publisher]

be rejected absolutely. In his unmindfulness of the demands of etiquette, he has placed the hadith on a pedestal so lofty that it performs an affront to the Holy Quran and one is forced to reject its truth. He gives little thought to whether the position he has endorsed puts him at odds with the Holy Quran; for he has given precedence to the narrations of the hadith over the clear accounts of Allah's Book and believes that these narratives are superior to the Word of Allah. Allah Almighty says in the Holy Quran:

فَيَأْتِي حَدِيثٌ بَعْدَ اللَّهِ وَآيَاتِهِ يُؤْمِنُونَ¹

That is, what word will they believe in after [rejecting] the word of Allah and His signs. In this verse, the word hadith is used in the singular and generic form to establish that any type of tradition or discourse which contradicts and opposes the Holy Quran and cannot be reconciled with its teachings ought to be rejected. The verse is also a prophecy for it alludes to the future fate of the ummah, amongst whom some would neglect the Holy Quran in favour of conflicting hadith. Thus, the *Ahl-e-Hadith* tilt towards an extreme position in emphasizing the hadith over the testimony of the Holy Quran. If they had remained just and God-fearing, they could have easily reconciled the hadith with the Holy Quran.

Instead, they have come to gladly reject and discard the absolute and infallible Word of God, but cannot bring themselves to either deny those hadith which contradict it or seek to understand

1. *Sūrah al-Jāthiyah*, 45:7 [Publisher]

them in light of God's Book. This is the extreme viewpoint of Maulavī Muḥammad Ḥussain.

Meanwhile, his opponent, Maulavī 'Abdullāh Ṣāhib, has positioned himself on the other extreme and rejects the hadith in its entirety. In one sense this is tantamount to rejecting the Holy Quran itself for Allah the Exalted says:

قُلْ إِنْ كُنْتُمْ تُحِبُّونَ اللَّهَ فَاتَّبِعُونِي يُحْبِبْكُمُ اللَّهُ¹

Thus, since the love of God is linked with following the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, and the hadith are also a means by which the practical example of the Holy Prophet can be known, an individual who rejects the hadith also rejects a modality of following him. Maulavī 'Abdullāh Ṣāhib states that all the hadith are tainted by doubt and suspicion. However, this notion has come about due to a lack of reflection. The root cause of this view is the flawed and deficient manner in which hadith scholars have prioritized [the scriptural texts].

Their tendency to ascribe greater authority to the hadith than the Holy Quran has led many people astray. According to this perspective, they believe that both the book of Allah and the hadith are on hand when needed. They go on to suggest that the latter stands as an authority over the former, as if the hadith is a judge seated upon the bench and the book of Allah stands at its behest as a plaintiff in its court. Anyone could be misled

1. Say, 'If you love Allah, follow me: then will Allah love you...' (*Sūrah Al-e-Imrān*, 3:32). [Publisher]

by such a view. After all, it was approximately one hundred to one hundred and fifty years after the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, that the hadith were collected and they are not free from human interpolation.

Further, the hadith are victim to doubt and conjecture and are comprised of so few narrations which may be deemed highly authentic that almost no reliable narrations exist at all. Hence, if the hadith were considered a judge over the Holy Quran this would inevitably mean that Islam is nothing more than a heap of conjecture and obviously mere suppositions are of no value. An individual who follows mere conjecture is far below the elevated station of truth.

Allah the Exalted says:

إِنَّ الظَّنَّ لَا يَغْنَىٰ مِنَ الْحَقِّ سَيِّئًا¹

That is, mere conjecture is incomparable with absolute certainty. Hence, this would necessarily imply that the entire text of the Holy Quran is useless and obsolete and it is not worthy of following without the edicts of a judge, that is to say the hadith. Yet the hadith themselves are ill-clad in the garb of conjecture and are not completely free from falsehood. For the naturally inherent aspect of conjecture is that it is never truly free from fabrication. In this way, not only does one have to dispense with the Holy Quran, one is also unable to adequately rely on the hadith.

1. *Sūrah Yūnus*, 10:37 [Publisher]

Both sources are thus rendered suspect. Such error has been the ruin of many.¹

I have penned this treatise in order to reveal the **right path**. Muslims have at their disposal three means by which they can establish themselves on the teachings of Islam.

(I.) **The Holy Quran:** the Book of God and there is no word available to us which is as absolute and certain. It is the Word of God and untainted by doubt and speculation.

(II.) **Second is the sunnah:** Here I differ from the *Ahl-e-Hadith* with regard to their application of the term for in my estimation the hadith and sunnah are not one and the same thing as is held by traditional scholars of hadith. As a matter of fact, the hadith and sunnah are two separate things. By sunnah I refer only to those actions of the Holy Prophet^{saw} which possess continuity and go

1. **Note:** When I had completed the writing of the announcement and perhaps only a couple of lines remained, I was overcome by sleep. Thus, I had no choice but to put away my pen and sleep. In my dream I saw Maulavī Muḥammad Ḥussain Batālavī and Maulavī ‘Abdullāh Chakrhalāvī. Addressing both of them, I said: *خسف القمر و الشمس في رمضان. فياي الآء ربكما تكذبن*, which means, the moon and the sun have already been eclipsed in the month of Ramadan, then why do you both gentlemen deny the favour of your Lord. I then said to Akhwīm Maulavī ‘Abdul-Karīm in my dream: ‘The favour’ in this context means me. Then I looked up at a veranda where a lamp was burning as if it was night time, and some people were copying this revelation from the Holy Quran with the help of the lamp, and I had a feeling that this revelation was to be found in the Holy Quran in the sequence just mentioned. I recognized one of those people to be Miyān Nabī Bakhsh darner of Amritsar. (Author)

hand in hand with the revelation of the Holy Quran. They shall always be preserved until the end of time. In other words, it may be said that the Holy Quran is the Word of God Almighty and the sunnah is the practice of the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him.

Since the remotest ages, it has been the practice of Allah that when the Prophets, peace be on them, communicate His Word to mankind for its guidance, they also illustrate it through their conduct and practical example, so that the people are able to comprehend it more clearly. Thus, the Prophets not only follow the Word [of God] themselves but exhort others to do the same.

(III.) The third source of guidance is **the hadith**, by which I mean those traditions that were related in the form of anecdotes by various narrators and were later collected and compiled approximately a hundred and fifty years after the life of the Holy Prophet^{saw}. Thus, the difference between the sunnah and the hadith is that the former refers to the practical example of the Holy Prophet^{saw} which was demonstrated by him and which possessed continuity. In terms of its authenticity, the sunnah is second only to the Holy Quran. Just as the Holy Prophet^{saw} was raised to propagate [the teachings] of the Holy Quran, he was also commissioned with establishing the sunnah. Therefore, just as the Holy Quran is absolute, so too is the established practice known as the sunnah. Both these tasks were personally discharged by the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, and he considered himself duty-bound to fulfil both. For example, when the obligatory prayers were enjoined, the Holy Prophet^{saw} demonstrated

this commandment of God Almighty and illustrated through his practice the number of *rak'āt* for *ḥajr*, *maghrib* and all the other Prayers as well. He also demonstrated the hajj and taught this practice to thousands from among his Companions, thereby ensuring its continuity. As such, this practical example [of the Holy Prophet^{saw}] which is clearly evident in the ummah even until now, is known as the sunnah. Conversely, the Holy Prophet^{saw} did not have the hadith recorded in his own presence nor did he make any provisions for their compilation. Some hadith were collected by Ḥaḍrat Abū Bakr, may Allah be pleased with him, but on account of his fear of God, he had all these hadith burned because he was not a witness to them himself and therefore could not be certain of their truth. When the age of the Companions, Allah be pleased with them, passed, God inspired the *ṭaba' ṭābi'īn*¹ with the desire to collect the hadith, and it was then that these narrations were gathered.

There is no doubt that a majority of the compilers of the hadith were righteous and God-fearing, and insofar as was within their ability they critiqued [the accuracy of] narrations; they rejected those which they felt were inauthentic and refused to accept narrations from any narrator of questionable character. Despite their superb efforts, this pursuit was undertaken many years after [the life of the Holy Prophet^{saw}] and was therefore heavily subject to speculation. Yet, in spite of all this, it would be most unfair to suggest that all of the hadith are unworthy, inauthentic, useless

1. The generation that followed the *ṭābi'īn* who themselves were the generation that followed the Companions of the Holy Prophet^{saw}. [Publisher]

and false. For such immense caution has been exercised in recording the hadith and such a phenomenal effort has been expended in critiquing and evaluating this corpus as is unparalleled in the history of religion. The Jews also had their own anecdotal records, and the Jewish sect that opposed Jesus was particularly known for adhering to them, but there is no evidence to suggest that Jewish scholars exercised the same diligence in collecting them as their Muslim counterparts.

It would be incorrect to think that until the hadith were compiled, people were unaware of the [number of] *rak'āt* in the obligatory Prayers or the rites of hajj. For the sunnah, which had taken root in them through a method of practice, had to all intents and purposes, taught every obligation and injunction laid down by Islam. Therefore, it is absolutely correct to state that if the hadith which were collected well after [the Holy Prophet^{saw}] had never even surfaced, there would be no deficiency in the fundamental teachings of Islam, for they had already been fully established by the Holy Quran and through a system of practice. The hadith served only to enhance this light, illuminating Islam as though it were نُورٌ عَلَى نُورٍ [light upon light]. Further, the hadith came forth and testified to the truth of the Holy Quran and sunnah. After Islam split into numerous sects, those among them who were truthful derived great benefit from authentic hadith.

Hence, a most appropriate view is that while one should abstain from the belief that where narratives of hadith clearly contradict those of the Holy Quran such narratives should be given preference and the Holy Quran should be abandoned, as is held by the *Ahl-e-Hadith* of the age, by the same token one should

not consider the hadith worthless and of no value as is held by Maulavī ‘Abdullāh Chakrhālavī. Rather, the Holy Quran and sunnah should be considered to possess authority over the hadith. However, it is also true that those hadith which do not contradict the Holy Quran ought to be followed with heart and soul, for this is the right path. Blessed are those who follow this way, and most unfortunate¹ and ignorant is the one who does not follow this principle and denies the hadith.

It is incumbent on **my Jamā‘at** to follow any hadith which does not oppose and contradict the Holy Quran and sunnah, regardless of its authenticity and give preference to it over man-made jurisprudence. And if they are unable to find [elaboration on] a certain matter from the hadith, the sunnah or from the

-
1. **Note:** Last night I saw in a dream a fruit-bearing tree laden with delicious and beautiful fruits, and that some people were trying to train a creeper onto the tree. The creeper had no root and simply appeared to be attached to the tree, like a parasite. As the creeper spread on the tree, it damaged its fruits and the tree was losing its beauty and becoming unattractive. Some of its expected fruits were likely to be lost and some had even been ruined. My heart was greatly moved and troubled by this and I asked a good and holy man who was standing near: What tree is this and what kind of a creeper has taken such a nice tree into its grip. He answered: This tree is the Quran, the Word of God, and this creeper is symbolic for those hadith and commentaries which are opposed to the Quran or are believed to contradict it. The largeness of their number has the tree in its grip and is damaging it. Then I woke up. I have been writing this treatise since that moment, which was the night just gone, and I am nearing the end. It is now late into the small hours of Saturday night and the clock has just struck forty minutes past one. **فالحمد لله على ذلك** [And all praise belongs to Allah for this]. M.G.A. [Author]

Holy Quran, in such a case, they should follow the Ḥanafī¹ school of jurisprudence, because this school constitutes the majority [among the Muslims] and this is an indication of God's will. If, because of modern developments, the Ḥanafī school of jurisprudence is unable to provide an adequate judgement, the scholars of the community ought to determine such issues in accordance with their God-given reasoning. However, at the same time they must exercise caution, lest they unjustly denounce the hadith like Maulavī 'Abdullāh Chakrhālāvī. Nonetheless, they ought to reject any such hadith which is at variance with the Quran and sunnah. Bear in mind that our Jamā'at is closer to [the doctrines] of the *Ahl-e-Hadith* and has no relation whatsoever with the absurd ideas of 'Abdullāh Chakrhālāvī. Everyone who is from among my Jamā'at ought to view his doctrines regarding the hadith, with a deep sense of aversion and revulsion.

Wherever possible they ought to eschew the company of such persons, for this sect is far more misguided than others.² My Jamā'at should neither overly emphasize the hadith, like those who belong to the class of Maulavī Muḥammad Ḥussain, nor should they reject them completely like 'Abdullāh. Rather, they ought to

-
1. One of the four main Schools of Islamic Jurisprudence. [Publisher]
 2. The same night at 3:02 a.m. I received the revelation:

مَنْ أَعْرَضَ عَنْ ذِكْرِي نَبْتَلِيهِ بَدْرِيَّةً فَاسِقَةً مَلْحَدَةً يَمِيلُونَ
إِلَى الدُّنْيَا وَلَا يَعْبُدُونَنِي شَيْئًا

He who turns away from the Holy Quran, We shall try him with evil progeny who would have a vicious life. They will run after the world and will partake nothing of My worship. In other words, the end of their progeny will be evil, and they will not be able to repent and adopt righteousness. (Author)

adopt a middle way as their guiding principle. That is to say, they ought not to consider the hadith the final authority on all matters of religion, and reject and abandon the Holy Quran. Nor should they consider the hadith redundant and worthless to the point that all the traditions of the Holy Prophet^{saw} are laid to waste. In similar vein, they ought not to deny the *Khatm-e-Nubuwwat* [finality of the prophethood] of the Holy Prophet^{saw}, nor interpret it in a way that would close the door of divine discourse and revelation on the ummah. Remember, **our belief** is that the Holy Quran is the Final Book and the Final Law, and until the Day of Judgment, no Prophet can appear who brings a new law or who receives revelation without having followed the Holy Prophet^{saw}. In fact, this door is firmly closed until the end of time; however, the door to revelation received through obedience to the Holy Prophet^{saw} is open until the Day of Judgement. That revelation which is the result of following the Holy Prophet^{saw} can never be terminated. But law-bearing or independent Prophethood has now come to an end.

ولا سبيل اليها الى يوم القيمة ومن قال انى لست من امة محمد
صلى الله عليه وسلم وادعى انه نبي صاحب الشريعة او من دون
الشريعة وليس من الامة فمثله كمثل رجل غمره السيلُ المنهمر
فالقاه وراه ولم يغادر حتى مات۔

1. It will not be possible till the Day of Judgment. He who says he is not from among the ummah of the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, and claims that he is a law-bearing Prophet, or that he is a Prophet who does not bear a law but does not belong to the [Muslim] ummah, is like one who has been carried away by a fierce flood and thrown aside, and it shall pursue him to death. [Publisher]

To further explain, where God Almighty has revealed that the Holy Prophet^{saw} is *Khātamul-Anbiyāʾ*, [the Seal of the Prophets] He has also indicated that he is the spiritual **father** of those who are righteous and only by following him can they achieve self-fulfilment and be blessed with divine discourse and revelation. For, in the Holy Quran God Almighty says:

مَا كَانَ مُحَمَّدٌ أَبَا أَحَدٍ مِّن رِّجَالِكُمْ وَلَكِن رَّسُولَ اللَّهِ
وَحَاتَمَ النَّبِيِّينَ¹

That is, the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, is not the father of any of your men, but he is the Messenger of Allah and *Khātamul-Anbiyāʾ*. Quite clearly the Arabic word *lākin* is applied here as an adversative particle or to compensate for what has been expressed in the previous clause. In the first part of this verse the fact of the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, physically fathering any male offspring is negated and the word *lākin* compensates this negative clause with the declaration that the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, is *Khātamul-Anbiyāʾ*. This means that after him the blessings of independent Prophethood would be terminated, and henceforth the excellence of Prophethood would only be bestowed on such a person whose deeds were testified to by the seal of the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, and this person would thus become his spiritual son and heir. Hence, where the fact of the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, being the physical father of [male]

1. *Sūrah al-Aḥzāb*, 33:41 [Publisher]

progeny has been denied, the truth of his [spiritual] fatherhood has been affirmed in order to counter the objection that is implied in the following verse:

إِنَّ شَانِئَكَ هُوَ الْأَبْتَرُ¹

In short, the meaning of this verse is that independent Prophethood, even of a non law-bearing kind, has come to an end. But, this does not prohibit the possibility of Prophethood that is illuminated by the lamp of Muhammad. The person who would possess this excellence was to be a follower of the Holy Prophet and would derive the qualities of Prophethood from the light of Muhammad. If this form of perfection [Prophethood] is denied to the devoted followers of this ummah, then the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, would remain without male issue in both a physical and spiritual sense, God forbid. And those who accused him of being without issue would have to be considered validated.

It has thus been sufficiently established that after the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, the door to independent Prophethood² has been firmly closed until the Day

1. Surely, it is thy enemy who is without issue (*Sūrah al-Kauthar*, 108:4).
[Publisher]

2. Certain ignorant *maulavīs* raise the objection that the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, foretold the coming of thirty imposters all of whom would claim Prophethood. The answer to this is: O foolish ones! Unfortunate ones!! Were you only destined to be blessed with thirty imposters. One fifth of the fourteenth century has already elapsed. The moon of *Khilāfat* has been completed in this time, as the

of Judgment. This station cannot be attained without following him or becoming his true servant. Therefore, to believe that Ḥaḍrat ‘Īsā [Jesus], peace be on him, will physically descend from the heavens and to claim that he will be an adherent of the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, and shall be illuminated by the light of his lamp is to adopt a laboriously concocted creed. How can it be true to suggest that anyone who has already been commissioned as a Prophet could owe the light of his Prophethood to the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him. And if he does not, then in what sense can he be considered a follower. It goes without saying that one can only be referred to as the follower of a Prophet if one has derived every excellence through the Prophet to whom he is subservient. Surely someone who has attained the excellence of prophethood through his own right cannot be justly considered a follower for he is an independent Prophet, for which there is no place after the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him. And, if it is suggested that Jesus shall be shorn of his previous Prophethood and bestowed with a new one by virtue of following the Holy Prophet^{saw}, as is intimated in the above verse, I would

Quran says وَالْقَمَرَ قَدَرْتُهُ مَنَازِلَ [And for the moon We have appointed stages, *Sūrah Yā Sīn*, 36:40] and the world approaches its end but your imposters just do not come to an end. Perhaps they will accompany you to the grave. O foolish ones! Satan—the greatest of all imposters—resides within you, hence the reason you have failed to recognize the time. You do not see the signs of Heaven. However, why should I be disappointed in you, for he who was raised fourteen hundred years after Mūsā [Moses] was also vilified as the Antichrist by the impious Jews of the time. فَالْقُلُوبَ تَشَابَهتِ اللّٰهُمَّ اَرْحَمِ [Their hearts have become alike. May Allah have mercy on them]. (Author)

say that surely a true follower from among this ummah, which has been described as the best ummah, would be more entitled to this station; thus, there is absolutely no need to bring back Ḥaḍrat ʿĪsā [Jesus] from heaven. For if the excellence of prophethood can be achieved by following the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, then, to haul someone down from heaven is to impinge upon another's right. There is nothing to prevent a follower of the Holy Prophet^{saw} from receiving this blessing, for this is a confirmation of the fact that Muhammad is the [true] source of all spiritual grace. There is a sense of meaninglessness in raising somebody as a Prophet who has already been elevated to this station. For example, would a person who claims they have the power to create gold be acclaimed as an alchemist simply by casting a spell on a piece of gold and then suggesting to have created something which already existed.

So, the excellence of the grace of the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, lies in the fact that a follower of his could achieve this station by entirely submitting himself to him. But to label one a follower who has previously achieved the rank of Prophethood—and to suggest that he attained this station by devoting himself to the Holy Prophet^{saw}—is flawed to say the least. In fact, the two propositions are contradictory. For the truth is that Jesus achieved his Prophethood independently without following the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him. But, if he is considered a follower as the hadith ¹ *امامكم منكم* suggests, one would have to conclude that all the excellences of his Prophethood were **derived** from the prophet-

1. An Imam, from among you. [Publisher]

hood of Muhammad; however, it has already been established that the light of his Prophethood has not been illuminated by the lamp of Muhammad. This [creed] is demonstrably false and a complete contradiction in terms. And if it is suggested that Jesus [Ḥaḍrat ‘Īsā] would be a follower of the Holy Prophet, but would not derive his excellences from his Prophethood, then the essence of his being subservient to him would cease to exist within him. For as has already been explained, to be ‘a follower’ of the Holy Prophet means attaining every excellence through obedience to him as is explicated in the Holy Qurān at numerous instances. Thus, while the door is open for an individual to attain spiritual grace from the Master Prophet, it would be imprudent to adopt fabricated creeds and manifest contradictions. How can one who has not attained a single excellence by following the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of Allah be upon him, be considered a follower.

This explanation should also suffice as an answer to the objection raised by certain ignorant persons that divine revelation can only be received in the recipient’s mother tongue and [not another language] like Arabic. This principle only applies to those who make a claim to independent prophethood without having benefited from the light of the Prophethood of Muhammad. However, as for one who is a follower of the Holy Prophet and who derives the light of his prophethood from the blessings of the Prophethood of Muhammad can also receive revelation during divine discourse in the language of his master in testimony of the intimate relationship between the two.

Sadly, those who adhere to such beliefs wrong Ḥaḍrat ‘Īsā

[Jesus] in every conceivable way. Firstly, they raise him bodily to heaven without dispelling the allegation of his accursedness. In this way the objection of the Jews remains on his head. Secondly, they argue that the Holy Quran does not mention his death anywhere and thereby they create a case for his divinity. Thirdly, they raise him to heaven in a state of despondency. To raise a Prophet to the heaven who has scarcely twelve disciples and whose mission remains unfulfilled is akin to creating a type of hell for him. For his soul yearns for the completion of his mission. To seat him in heaven is to stand against his hope and longing. When I look within myself and contemplate the possibility of being raised alive to as high as the seventh heaven without having fulfilled the task for which I have come, I am overcome by unhappiness. What gladness can I derive from the thought that my mission has not been fulfilled. Similarly, there is no joy to be had [by Jesus^{as}] in his ascension to heaven either. In truth, he secretly migrated, but certain ignorant souls depicted his journey as one towards the sky. May God guide them.

والسّلام على من اتبع الهدى [And peace be on those who follow the guidance].

Published by,
Mirza Ghulam Ahmad of Qadian
27 November 1902

GLOSSARY

Fajr The time of the *fajr*, or morning [*ṣalāt*] prayer begins with dawn and ends before sunrise.

Hadith A saying of the Holy Prophet Muhammad^{saw}. The plural is *aḥādīth*.

Ḥaḍrat A term of respect used to show honour and reverence for a person of established righteousness and piety. The literal meaning is: his/her Holiness, Worship, Eminence, etc.

It is also used for God in the superlative sense.

Hajj Pilgrimage to the House of Allah in Makkah, Arabia; also known as the fifth pillar of Islam.

Holy Prophet^{saw} A title used exclusively for the Founder of Islam, Ḥaḍrat Muhammad^{saw}.

Holy Quran The final and perfect Scripture revealed by Allah for the guidance of mankind for all times to come. It was revealed word by word to the Holy Prophet Muhammad^{saw} over a period of twenty-three years.

Imam Mahdi A title meaning ‘Guided Leader’, given to the Reformer of the Latter Days prophesied by the Holy Prophet Muhammad^{saw}; *see also* **page vii**.

Khalifah Caliph is derived from the Arabic word *Khalīfah*, which means ‘successor’. In Islamic terminology, the word righteous *Khalīfah* is applied to one of the four *Khulafā’* who continued the mission of Ḥaḍrat Muhammad^{saw}, the Holy Prophet of Islam. Ahmadi Muslims refer to a successor of the Promised Messiah^{as} as Khalīfatul-Masīḥ. *Khulafā’* is the plural of *khalīfah*.

- Khalīfatul-Masīḥ** *see* Khalifah.
- Khatāmul-Anbiya'** The Seal of the Prophets, a title accorded to the Holy Prophet^{saw} in the Holy Quran.
- Khilāfat** The literal meaning of the term is successorship.
- Maghrib** Time of sunset. The term is also used for the prayer (*ṣalāt*) offered after sunset.
- Mahdi** Literally means 'Guided'. *see* Imam Mahdi.
- Maulavi** A Muslim religious cleric.
- Muhammad^{saw}** Founder of Islam. *see* Holy Prophet^{saw}.
- Promised Messiah^{as}** A title given to the Reformer prophesied to appear during the Latter Days, by the Holy Prophet Muhammad^{saw}; *see also* page vii.
- Rak'at** One unit of formal worship prescribed in Islam. Plural of *rak'at* is *rak'āt*.
- Ṣāḥib** A title of respect similar to diverse English terms like Mister, Honourable, and Revered.
- Ṣalāt** Five daily Prayers that are obligatory for Muslims.
- Sūrah** A chapter of the Holy Quran.
- Zakat** A term in Arabic that literally means 'increase' or 'purification'; technically signifies the obligatory alms prescribed in Islam.

INDEX

- ‘Abdullāh
denigration of hadith 11
- Abū Bakr, Ḥaḍrat
burned questionable *ahādīth*
on account of his fear of
God 8
- Ahl-e-Ḥadīth
extreme position in emphasizing hadith over Qurān 3
- Batālwi, Muḥammad Ḥusain
views on hadith 1-3
- Chakrhālvi, ‘Abdullāh
inventing new form of *ṣalāt* 2
preposterous views of, 11
rejection of hadith by, 4
- Conjecture
Qurān on comparison of
certainty with, 5
- Criteria
for judging hadith 10
- Fatherhood
of Holy Prophet 13
- Finality
of Holy Prophet 12
- God
love of, linked to following
Holy Prophet 4
- Hadith
‘Abdullāh Chakrhālvi’s rejection of, 4
compilation of, 5-8
criteria for judging 10
difference between sunnah and, 7
majority of compilers were
God-fearing
rejection of, tantamount to
rejection of Qurān 4
scholars ascribing authority
over Qurān 4
served only to enhance light of
Islam 9
sheds light on Qurān 1
subservient to Qurān 5
third means for muslims to
establish themselves on
Islam 7
what is meant by, 7

- Hajj
 ‘Abdullāh Chakrhālvi’s
 attempt to change practices
 of, 2
 Holy Prophet perfected
 customs of, 8
- Ḥanafī
 Promised Messiah’s advice on
 following school of, 10
- Holy Prophet^{saw}
 attaining prophethood by
 following 16
 fatherhood of, 13
 finality of, 12
 love of God linked to follow-
 ing, 4
 practically illustrated *rak‘āt* in
 Prayer 7
- Ḥusain, Muḥammad
 over-emphasis on hadith 11
- Islam
 role of sunnah and hadith
 in, 9
 three means for Muslims to
 establish themselves on, 6
- Jamā‘at
 advice to members of, regard-
 ing hadith 10
 view in relation to
Ahl-e-Hadith 11
- Jesus
 descent of, 15
 fulfilling the mission of, 18
 prophethood of, 15
 wrong beliefs regarding 17
- Jews
 compilation of records com-
 pared with Muslims 9
- Khātamul-Anbiyā’* 13
- Language
 of revelation 17
- Prayers
 Holy Prophet illustrated *rak‘āt*
 in, 7
- Promised Messiah
 advice on following Ḥanafī
 School of jurisprudence 10
 advice to Jamā‘at regarding
 hadith 10
 differing from Ahl-e-Ḥadīth 6
 reason for writing this
 treatise 6
- Prophecy
 Quran on fate of ummah 3
- Prophethood
 after the Holy Prophet 13
 of Holy Prophet 12
 of Jesus 15
- Prophets
 illustrate God’s word through
 conduct 7
- Quran
 authority of, in relation to
 hadith 2
 conjecture incomparable with
 certainty 5
 correct status of hadith com-
 pared to, 3:5
 primary means for Muslims
 to establish themselves on
 Islam 6
 prophecy on the fate of
 ummah 3
 rejection of hadith tanta-
 mount to rejection of, 4

- scholars ascribing hadith
 authority over 4
 superiority over hadith
 Revelation
 door of, opened through Holy
 Prophet 12
 language of, 17
Ṣalāt
 ‘Abdullāh Chakrhālvī invent-
 ing his own form of, 2
 Scholars
 of hadith ascribing authority
 over Quran 4
 responsible for leading people
 astray 4
 Seal of the Prophets 13
 Sunnah
 difference between hadith
 and, 7
 second means for muslims
 to establish themselves on
 Islam 6
 what is meant by, 6
 Zakat
 ‘Abdullāh Chakrhālvī’s
 attempt to change practices
 of, 2